# A Review of Remuneration

For the

**Elected Mayor** 

Of the
West Yorkshire
Combined Authority

By the

**Independent Remuneration Panel** 

Dr Declan Hall (Chair)
Carolyn Lord
Very Reverend George Nairn-Briggs

March 2021

#### **Introduction: IRP's Remit and Regulatory Context**

- 1. This report contains the recommendations made by the independent remuneration panel (Panel or IRP) appointed by the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (WYCA) to make a recommendation to the WYCA on the remuneration of the new post of elected Mayor (the Mayor) of the West Yorkshire Combined Authority from the date that the Mayor takes up the term of office on 10<sup>th</sup> May 2021.
- 2. The West Yorkshire Combined Authority was established under the *West Yorkshire Combined Authority Order 2014* (SI 2014/864) and which assigned to the WYCA functions previously exercised by the West Yorkshire Integrated Transport Authority and its Passenger Transport Executive, in addition to economic development and regeneration related powers.
- 3. The Constituent Councils of the WYCA are the five metropolitan boroughs that make up West Yorkshire, namely Bradford, Calderdale, Kirklees, Leeds and Wakefield.
- 4. The 2014 Order provides for each constituent authority to have one formal member. They can be any elected Member from each of the Constituent Councils but currently each Constituent Council has appointed their respective Council Leader. There are three additional elected Members for political balance jointly appointed by the Constituent Councils these eight are the full voting Members. The City of York as a Non-Constituent Council appoints an elected Member and the Leeds City Region Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP) also appoints one member both of these members are non-voting, unless specifically given voting rights by the Authority.
- 5. On 30<sup>th</sup> January 2021 *the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (Election of Mayor and Functions) Order 2021* (2012/112) came into force. This moves forward on the Devolution Deal for the WYCA, with the WYCA becoming a mayoral combined authority (MCA). Voting for the Mayor will take place on 6<sup>th</sup> May 2021.
- 6. The 2021 Order also allows for the remuneration of the elected Mayor. However, the 2021 Order (paragraphs 8-9 of Schedule 1 to the 2014 Order as substituted by Schedule 7 of the 2021 Order) specifies that the remuneration of the Mayor is subject to the following conditions:
  - the WYCA may establish an independent remuneration panel who may make recommendations to the WYCA regarding the allowances payable to the Mayor
  - The WYCA many only pay an allowance to the Mayor after considering a report from the IRP containing recommendations for such an allowance
  - The allowance to be paid by the WYCA does not exceed the amount specified in the recommendations made by the IRP
- 7. In advance of the election of the West Yorkshire Mayor so as to facilitate the

process of reviewing the mayoral remuneration, the WYCA Head of Legal and Governance was delegated authority by the WYCA at its meeting on 10<sup>th</sup> December 2020 to recruit and convene an IRP.

#### The IRP

- 8. The members of the Panel appointed by the WYCA are:
  - Dr Declan Hall (Chair):
    - a former lecturer at the Institute of Local Government, the University of Birmingham, currently an independent consultant who specialises in Members Allowances and support. Dr Hall also chairs the IRP for the Greater Manchester Combined Authority (GMCA) and the Sheffield City Region Combined Authority (SCRCA).

## • Carolyn Lord:

- formerly a Member of Leeds IRP and IRP for various West Yorkshire authorities, and Independent Person for WYCA, solicitor in commercial practice, specialising in town and country planning and related areas of law, former governor of Leeds Trinity University and now governor of Leeds Conservatoire
- Very Reverend George Nairn-Briggs AKC DL:
  - Member of Calderdale IRP, Chair of Wakefield Standards Committee; formerly a Whitehall Press Officer, Bishop's Adviser on Social Responsibility and Dean of Wakefield; currently Dean Emeritus and since 2006 a Deputy Lord Lieutenant of West Yorkshire
- 9. The work of the Panel was supported by the following:
  - Angie Shearon, Governance Service Manager, WYCA
  - James Young, Governance Services Team Leader, WYCA

#### How the IRP approached the review

- 10. Due to the current Covid-19 pandemic the IRP met virtually via MS Teams on the 5<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> February 2021. It was at these meetings that the IRP considered the range of information that was provided to it and met with a cross-party section of WYCA Members to discuss the nature of WYCA, the role of the elected Mayor and other issues to consider in arriving at recommended mayoral remuneration. The IRP also met with the WY Police and Crime Commissioner to discuss that particular aspect of the mayoral role. Finally, the IRP met with a range of Officers from both WYCA and the Office of the West Yorkshire Police and Crime Commissioner.
- 11. The IRP also received and reviewed a wide range of written evidence and material from Officer briefing papers to benchmarking data. For further details on the range of evidence the IRP considered in its deliberations and in arriving at its recommended allowance for the West Yorkshire elected Mayor see:

Appendix 1: the range of information that was formally presented to and

considered by the IRP and sent to the IRP prior to its formal

meetings.

Appendix 2: the Members who made representations to the IRP and

the Officers who provided factual briefings to the IRP.

Appendix 3: Benchmarking data (BM1-3) reviewed by the IRP

#### The West Yorkshire Combined Authority

- 12. The 2021 Order represents a step change for the WYCA. As set out in the Devolution Deal (11<sup>th</sup> March 2020) it will attract £1.8 billion of government investment (including £1.14 billion gainshare over 30 years), which will be subject to local influence and decision making, enabling expenditure on local priorities, together with a range of devolved functions.
- 13. Accordingly the WYCA has been conferred a number of additional non-Mayoral functions, mainly in regards to the following:

#### Transport

- Transport-related powers to set up and coordinate a Key Route Network on behalf of the Mayor
- Collect contributions from utility companies for diversionary works needed from highways work carried out on the Key Route Network
- Powers to operate a permit scheme to control works

#### Adult Education and Skills

- Control of the Adult Education Budget (AEB)
- Promote effective participation in education and training of young people aged 16 and 17, and make available appropriate support services to young people and relevant young adults
- Ensure that skills provision in West Yorkshire supports adults to develop the skills they need to enter and stay in work, or enrol in an apprenticeship, traineeship, or other learning, and meets the needs of the region's businesses
- Ensure that adult education and training in West Yorkshire promotes high standards, fair access to opportunity and fulfils individuals' learning potential, and that relevant institutions in the further education sector provide appropriate education to specified individuals aged between 16 and 18 years

#### Housing

- Functions relating to compulsory purchase, plus provision of housing and land, land acquisition and disposal, and development and regeneration of land
- To exercise these functions, some powers will be granted concurrently with Constituent Councils, or Homes England, as appropriate. The aims and ambitions are to:
  - Improve the supply and quality of housing
  - Secure regeneration or development of land or infrastructure

- Support in other ways the creation, regeneration and development of communities
- Contribute to achieving sustainable development and good design

#### Finance

- Power to borrow up to an agreed cap for non-transport functions (forthcoming)
- 14. In addition, and subject to agreement, any Constituent Council and the Combined Authority may enter into arrangements to allow delegation of functions from a Constituent Council to the Combined Authority and may also enter into joint arrangements in respect of Non-Mayoral Functions with the Combined Authority and any Constituent Council or other local authority.
- 15. Although these new responsibilities are non-Mayoral functions as they are reserved to the full WYCA the elected Mayor will have an active role in the exercise of these functions as the 11<sup>th</sup> Member of WYCA and with full voting rights. Moreover, by law the Mayor by virtue of their office will be the Chair of the Combined Authority, giving the post holder a leading role in the exercise of the functions reserved to the full Authority.

#### The Mayoral Functions

16. The 2021 Order provides the Mayor with the following Mayoral functions:

#### • Transport:

- Power to draw up a Local Transport Plan and Strategies
- Power to request local regulations requiring large fuel retailers to provide Electric Vehicle charging points
- Bus franchising powers
- Ability to pay grants to operators

#### Housing and Planning

- Housing and land acquisition powers to support housing, regeneration, infrastructure and community development wellbeing
- Power to designate a Mayoral Development Area and then set up a Mayoral Development Corporation

#### Finance

- Power for the Mayor to set a precept on council tax to fund Mayoral functions (resulting from the setting of the Mayoral budget)
- Power to change business rate supplement (subject to ballot)

#### • Police and Crime Commissioner

- Securing the maintenance of an efficient and effective police force and holding the chief constable to account
- Issuing a police and crime plan, determining police and crime objectives
- o Attendance at Police and Crime Panel
- Preparing an annual report
- Calculating a council tax or budget requirement (precept)

- Maintaining of the Police Fund
- o Appointing, suspending or calling on a chief constable to retire or resign
- Delegating some of these functions to a Deputy Mayor for Policing and Crime
- Consulting the public to ensure that their views and priorities on community safety issues inform the police and crime plan
- Commissioning of services which include supporting victims and tackling reoffending
- Strengthening links such as between inclusive growth and community safety and cohesion
- 17. While the Mayoral powers in relation to Transport, Housing and Planning and Finance are more or less standard to most Combined Authority Mayors the Police and Crime Commissioner function is unusual: the only other Combined Authority Mayor who has PCC functions is the Mayor of the Greater Manchester Combined Authority (GMCA). While some of the Mayoral functions in relation to Police and Crime may be delegated to a Deputy Mayor of Policing and Crime (appointed by the Mayor) the Mayor will be accountable for all those functions.
- 18. The Mayor has authority (and is therefore accountable) for all functions for which they are responsible (including PCC functions), including those which may be carried out by another person on behalf of the Mayor under delegated authority from the Mayor. The Mayor cannot delegate any Mayoral Function to a committee to carry out on their behalf.

#### Mayoral 'Soft' Powers and Leadership Skills

- 19. In addition to the expanded responsibilities of WYCA and the 'hard' powers that will be exercisable by the Mayor there is the more ill-defined or what the IRP has called (after noting the views of several of those people interviewed) 'soft' powers that the Mayor will exercise. The mandate arising from being directly elected on a WY-wide basis will provide the Mayor with a unique platform to represent WYCA to the rest of the world and be the public face of the Authority on a regional, national and international level. As a directly elected individual, the Mayor is directly accountable to the electorate for their ability to represent communities and businesses, raise living standards, realise economic ambitions and harness opportunities for the region. The Mayor will be at the forefront of the delivery of the largest devolution deal of its kind, with more than £1.8 billion in investment.
- 20. While the elected Mayor will have many formal powers, including proposing a budget and strategies, the post holder will still have to confer, collaborate, negotiate and foster a consensus with both other WYCA Members and stakeholders to effectively discharge the mayoral functions. As such the elected Mayor as chair of the WYCA will need to exercise leadership skills to ensure the WYCA functions effectively. For instance, while the Mayor will have powers to prepare the WYCA Mayoral Budget they will have to consult the other WYCA Members who in turn can make their own proposals and overrule the draft Mayoral budget with a 5/8 majority, where the Mayor does not vote
- 21. This makes the role of West Yorkshire elected Mayor more complex than an executive mayor of a principal council; the elected Mayor will be required to act as

an advocate for WYCA and work across the five WYCA constituent councils and with their Leaders. The West Yorkshire elected Mayor will be required to develop and strengthen relationships with the other Leaders and WY stakeholders and build cohesion to develop collective understanding of WYCA, in line with the agreed protocols.

- 22. The elected Mayor will be expected to lead in a number of areas that are not specifically designated mayoral functions, whether it is representing WYCA to Ministers or representing the WYCA on the LEP, which covers a wider geographical area than that of the Combined Authority and has an essential role across the public and private sectors to stimulate growth in the city region. The elected mayor will also represent the Combined Authority on other strategic bodies as needed. For instance, the National Police Air Service (NPAS) is currently delivered by West Yorkshire Police on behalf of British Policing. It is possible that the Mayor will chair the NPAS National Strategic Board, which is currently chaired by the WY PCC, although this position is under review.
- 23. Moreover, the role of elected Mayor will continue to evolve as devolution rolls out generally and in West Yorkshire in particular, which has some of the most developed devolved arrangements of all Combined Authorities.
- 24. The Mayor will have a demanding and wide-ranging role representing a population of over 2.5 million residents of West Yorkshire. They will represent their electorate on a regional, pan-regional, national, and international stage; the Mayor will join the other regional Mayors (currently the M9 Group) in regular meetings with Ministers and Whitehall departments to champion devolution and promote regional challenges and opportunities.
- 25. The role will require strong and visible leadership, strategic oversight and coordination of long-term transformational programmes, and significant budget responsibility. This brings visibility and prominence of the role of a regional Mayor, both regionally and nationally, and the degree of scrutiny which will be attached to it
- 26. By virtue of holding the office the Mayor will be able to use it as a platform to be the voice of West Yorkshire in a way that is not constitutionally defined. As the only directly elected West Yorkshire wide politician the role will be high profile and the 'go to' politician for the local, regional and national media. An example of this is the increased profile for Combined Authority Mayors during the current Covid pandemic; they have become more noticeable by speaking and advocating on behalf of their respective regions in relation to the government's policy on dealing with the Covid pandemic.
- 27. Clearly the role of Mayor will be a significant one, requiring the equivalent of a full time commitment but it will also be distinctive in that the Mayor will have the PCC responsibilities and roles (shared only by the Mayor of the GMCA).

#### Benchmarking - other comparable roles

28. The West Yorkshire elected Mayor as a result of the extent of WY devolution will be one of the most powerful mayors in English local government. Yet, it is recognised that the Mayor's remuneration cannot be based on a market-led

approach i.e. set at a level comparable to senior directors in the private sector or even public sector. Not only would it be a confusing analogy it would also not acknowledge the public service element, a principle that is followed by the statutory IRPs for principal councils in recognition that recompense should not be a driving factor for candidates putting themselves forward for public office.

#### West Yorkshire Council Leaders, Other Public Office Holders and Metro Mayors

29. The IRP undertook an extensive benchmarking exercise to compare how other public posts were paid. A starting point was the remuneration of the Leaders of the five West Yorkshire Councils, which shows a mean/median remuneration of £48,059/£48,756 respectively. While it is acknowledged that the West Yorkshire constituent council Leaders have extensive executive powers within their respective authorities, the scope and remit of the WYCA and nature of the role and responsibilities of the West Yorkshire Mayor, has led the IRP to conclude that the roles are not directly comparable.

#### Comparing WYCA Mayor to other public posts

- 30. The IRP also looked at the remuneration of a range of other public post holders (see appendix three for full details) and noted that IRPs for other Combined Authorities paid particular attention to the remuneration of their local Police and Crime Commissioner and that of a UK backbench MP, chiefly what MPs were paid at the time of their review. In particular, a number of other Combined Authority IRPs had linked their respective recommended Mayoral remuneration to that of an MP, followed by paying close cognisance to the remuneration of the local Police and Crime Commissioner.
- 31. The IRP noted that these posts are currently paid as follows:

UK MP £81,932
 West Yorkshire Police & Crime Commissioner £100.000

- 32. The IRP concluded that the posts and remuneration of MPs were not particularly relevant for benchmarking purposes. The role of the West Yorkshire elected Mayor can be seen as larger than that of an MP in terms of strategic responsibilities, accountability and range of soft powers.
- 33. While the same can be said when comparing the roles and responsibilities of the West Yorkshire elected Mayor and West Yorkshire Police and Crime Commissioner the fact that the West Yorkshire elected Mayor will take on the role and functions of the West Yorkshire PCC must provide a logical starting point for the IRP in terms of mayoral remuneration. The IRP notes that currently the WY PCC appoints a Deputy PCC who is remunerated by way of salary. Similarly, the West Yorkshire elected Mayor is able to appoint a Deputy Mayor for Policing and Crime, which presumably will also be remunerated as part of the paid service. The IRP will take into account the appointment of a Deputy Mayor for Policing and Crime on Mayoral remuneration, as well as the overall impact on the wider remuneration by way of allowances paid across WYCA, at the time of any subsequent review called by the Combined Authority. However, the IRP further notes that the appointment of a Deputy Mayor for Policing and Crime does not in

any way diminish the responsibility of the West Yorkshire elected Mayor in respect of Police and Crime functions.

#### **Elected Mayors of other English Combined Authorities**

34. Unlike when most other IRPs were assessing remuneration for their respective Combined Authority Mayors there is now a meaningful number of elected Mayors of the other Combined Authorities to benchmark against. The current remuneration of other Metro Mayors is as follows

•	Greater Manchester	£110,000
•	Liverpool City Region	£80,631
•	Sheffield City Region	£79,000
•	West Midlands	£79,000
•	Cambridgeshire & Peterborough	£75,000
•	West of England	£65,000
•	North of the Tyne	£65,000
•	Tees Valley	£36,592

- 35. The mean/median remuneration of English metro Mayors is £73,847/£77,000 respectively.
- 36. The IRP notes that the remuneration of nearly all other Metro Mayors was determined 2-3 years ago (thus building in a lag when it comes to benchmarking). It also considered that as the only other Metro Mayor with PCC responsibilities that the West Yorkshire elected Mayor is most comparable to that of the Greater Manchester elected Mayor, who is paid £110,000. Yet, the IRP has concluded that the remuneration of the West Yorkshire elected Mayor should not be as high as the Greater Manchester elected Mayor. The Greater Manchester Mayor also has PCC functions but in addition, has functions unique to that post including strategic responsibilities for Fire & Rescue and has added responsibilities associated with other GMCA functions, mostly in relation to waste disposal and public health.
- 37. Consequently, the IRP has decided that it is appropriate to take a figure that is mid-way between the figures of £100,000 (WY PCC remuneration) and £110,000 (GMCA mayoral remuneration) to recommend a remuneration of £105,000 for the West Yorkshire elected Mayor.
- 38. In arriving at this figure (and in addition to finding no justification to reduce the remuneration level currently applied to the PCC, which had been set in 2012 by the Home Secretary) the IRP noted that the role of elected Mayor for West Yorkshire is significant and complex not necessarily fully recognised in the constitutional roles, but also in the exercise of 'soft' powers derived from the platform that the role gives the elected Mayor. The IRP has looked at a wide range of benchmarking, across other public sector and elected roles. The IRP concluded that the level of influence, scale and complexity of the role was greater than some other roles used as benchmarks elsewhere, particularly in relation to a backbench MP's salary and the majority of other Metro Mayors. The IRP also considered the valuable views imparted by those interviewed concerning a range of measures and considerations relevant to an assessment of the appropriate remuneration level.

39. The IRP was also cognisant that the Authority could not adopt a higher remuneration than recommended, but could always adopt a lower figure than recommended. It further notes that the remuneration of Metro elected Mayors is not pensionable, unlike MPs and Police and Crime Commissioners for instance. Similarly, In London, under provisions of the Greater London Authority Act 1999 (section 26); the Mayor and members of the Assembly may still be entitled to other pension provision. Such alternative provision has been made and from 1<sup>st</sup> January 2018 pensions for elected Members are provided under a Master Trust Pension Scheme and administered by Aviva, for Members who choose to join it. No similar separate provision exists for Metro Mayor's remuneration.

#### The IRPs recommendation

- 40. Thus bearing in mind the evaluation of the anticipated role of the West Yorkshire elected Mayor, the representations received and benchmarking the IRP has concluded that the remuneration of the West Yorkshire elected Mayor should be £105,000 on the evidence currently available.
- 41. The IRP recommends that the remuneration of the West Yorkshire elected Mayor is set at £105,000.

#### The Indexation of the Mayoral Remuneration

- 42. The IRP notes that Councillors' Allowances at the level of principal councils are routinely indexed by an appropriate metric. This has the advantage of helping to ensure that the Mayoral remuneration does not lose relative value, thus requiring not insignificant uplifts periodically to maintain that original value.
- 43. The IRP has decided to follow common practice at the principal council level and recommend that the mayoral remuneration is indexed. In arriving at the appropriate index the IRP has again followed common practice in the principal councils and adopted the percentage annual cost of living salary increase as applied each year to staff. This figure is agreed upon annually by the Joint Negotiating Committee for Local Government Staff, typically known as the NJC index. It has the advantage of treating elected Members and salaried Officers equally.
- 44. The IRP recommends that the Mayoral remuneration is indexed linked to the NJC index, namely the percentage annual cost of living salary increase as applied each year to staff.

# Appendix One: List of Information considered by the IRP

- 1. Officer produced briefing paper "Remuneration for the Mayor"
- 2. West Yorkshire Devolution Briefing Book for the WYCA
- 3. WYCA Governance structure diagram
- 4. Comparing functions of Combined Authorities grid
- 5. The West Yorkshire Combined Authority Order 2014 (SI 2014/864), 1st April 2014
- 6. The West Yorkshire Combined Authority (Election of Mayor and Functions) Order 2021 (SI 2021/112) 29<sup>th</sup> January 2021
- 7. West Yorkshire Combined Authority Members' Allowances Scheme 2019/20
- 8. Briefing paper on GLA governance arrangements and functions
- 9. Benchmarking data namely:
  - Remuneration paid to Leaders of West Yorkshire Councils
  - Remuneration paid to other Combined Authority elected mayors
  - Remuneration paid to other public posts
- 10. https://www.westyorkshire-pcc.gov.uk/our-business/the-police-crime-plan
- 11. WestYorkshirePolice&CrimeCommissionerAnnualReport 2019/20

# Appendix Two: Members and Officers who met with the IRP

#### Members:

Cllr S. Golton: WYCA Member (Liberal Democrat Leeds)

Cllr S. Hinchcliffe: Chair of WYCA, Labour Leader Bradford

R. Marsh OBE DL: Chair of Local Enterprise Partnership (LEP)

Cllr S. Leigh MBE: WYCA Member (Conservative Calderdale)

Mark Burns-Williamson OBE: WY Police & Crime Commissioner

#### Officers:

Caroline Allen: WYCA Monitoring Officer

Katherine Johnson: WY Police Chief Officer

Janine Nelson: OPCC Chief of Staff

Angie Shearon: WYCA Governance Services Manager

Ben Still: WYCA Managing Director

Angela Taylor: WYCA Section 73 Officer

# **Appendix Three: Benchmarking Data**

# **BM1 – Allowances paid to Mayors – Other Combined Authorities**

	Mayoral Allowance	No. of Authorities	Approx. Population
West Yorkshire		5 councils	2.5 million
Cambridge and Peterborough	£75,000	8 councils	850,000
Greater Manchester	£110,000	10 councils	2,756,000
Liverpool	£80,631	6 councils	1,512,600
North of Tyne	£65,000	3 councils	880,000
Sheffield	£79,000	4 councils	1.8 million
Tees Valley	£37,146	5 councils	700,000
West of England	£65,000	3 councils	1.1 million
West Midlands	£79,000	7 councils	2,928,592
Mean	£73,847		
Median	£77,000		

# **BM2 – Remuneration paid to Leaders – West Yorkshire Metropolitan Councils**

West Yorkshire Council	Basic allowance	Leader (Special Responsibility Allowance)	Total
Bradford	£13,463.16	£37,056.36	£50,519.52
Calderdale	£10,559	£31,677	£42,236
Kirklees	£14,002	£26,364	£40,366
Leeds	£16,279.87	£42,139.13	£58,419
Wakefield	£12,035	£36,721	£48,756
Mean	£13,268	£34,791	£48,059
Median	£13,463	£36,721	£48,756

£67,649

# BM3 – Remuneration paid to other Public Posts – November 2020 (unless indicated otherwise)

## <u>UK/Devolved Nations – elected representatives</u>

UK MPs: £81,932
 Minister of State (UK) £116,019¹
 UK Parliamentary Under Secretary £106,409²
 Member of the (NI) Legislative Assembly: £50,500
 Member of the Scottish Parliament: £64,470

·

#### **GLA/Other London Public Bodies**

Member of the Welsh Assembly:

Mayor of London: £152,734
 Statutory Deputy Mayor £105,269
 Chair of London Assembly: £70,225
 London Assembly Members: £58,543
 Chair London Pension Funds Authority £50,800

#### NHS – Non Executive Appointments Remunerations

NHS Non-Executive £13,000 (1 April 2021)
 NHS Trust Chair £40,000 - £55,500 (min 1/04/21)

£43,000 - £60,000 (min1/04/22)<sup>3</sup>

## **Police and Crime Commissioners**

West Yorkshire

Police & Crime Commissioner £100,000<sup>4</sup>

Where a PCC also has responsibility for fire £3,000 extra

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> MPs Salary £81,932 (April 2020) + Minister of State Salary £34,087 (April 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> MPs Salary £81,932 (April 2020) + Parliamentary Under Secretary Salary £24,477 (April 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> NHS, Structure to align remuneration of chairs and non-executive directors of NHS Trusts and NHS Foundation Trusts. Chairs salary range is dependent on annual turnover of Trust.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Senior Salary Review Body recommended 2% increase across the board in 2018 but was not implemented